

**State Safe Harbor/Civil Immunity Legislative Tracker**

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
Alabama	<a href="#">SB 30</a>	<b><u>ENACTED</u></b> (Feb. 11, 2021)	<i>Covered Entities</i> including businesses entities, health care providers, educational entities, churches, governmental entities, and cultural institutions.	Provides that covered entities are not liable for any damages, injury, or death suffered by any person or entity as a result of, or in connection with, a COVID-19 claim arising from any act or omission of the covered entity.  Limits a covered entity’s liability to actual economic compensatory damages and provides that a covered entity can <u>not</u> be liable for noneconomic or punitive damages.	Provides that the immunities offered do <u>not</u> apply where the plaintiff shows—by clear and convincing evidence—that the defendant caused the damages, injury, or death by acting with wanton, reckless, willful, or intentional misconduct.  Does <u>not</u> preclude parties alleging wrongful death from obtaining punitive damages.
Alaska	<a href="#">SB 241</a>	<b><u>ENACTED</u></b> (May 18, 2020)	<i>Health care providers</i> that provide health care services (e.g., hospital, medical clinic or office, special care facility, medical laboratory, physician, pharmacist, dentist, physician assistant, nurse, paramedic, emergency medical or laboratory technician, etc.) <u>and</u> nursing homes.	Provides that <i>health care providers</i> and <i>PPE manufacturers</i> are not liable for civil damages resulting from an act or omission in issuing, providing, or manufacturing PPE in the event of injury or death to the user of the PPE if the PPE was issued, provided, or manufactured in good faith to respond to the COVID-19 public health disaster emergency.  Requires such health care providers and PPE manufacturers to notify the user of the PPE that the equipment may not meet established federal standards and requirements.	Does <u>not</u> preclude liability for civil damages as a result of gross negligence, recklessness, or intentional misconduct.

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
Arizona	<a href="#">SB 1377</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Apr. 5, 2021)	<i>Person</i> includes businesses, educational institutions, property owners or managers, organizations, health professionals, health care providers, etc.	Provides that any <i>person</i> that acts in <i>good faith</i> is <u>not</u> liable for damages in any COVID-19-related civil action for injury, death, or loss to person or property.  Presumes that a <i>person</i> acted in good faith if they adopted and implemented reasonable policies (e.g., policies that relied on state or federal guidance) regarding the pandemic.	Does <u>not</u> extend the limitation on liability to acts or omissions that constitute willful misconduct or gross negligence.
District of Columbia	<a href="#">B23-0735</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (May 15, 2020)	Any <i>health care provider, first responder, volunteer, or District government contractor or subcontractor</i> (i.e., “providers”), including a party involved in the health care process at the request of a health care facility or the District government <u>and</u> acting within the scope of the provider’s employment or organization’s purpose <u>or</u> contractual or voluntary service, even if outside the provider’s professional scope of practice, state of licensure, or with an expired license, who: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prescribes or dispenses medicines for off-label use to attempt to combat the COVID-19 virus, in accordance with the federal Right to Try Act.</li> <li>• Provides direct or ancillary healthcare services or products (e.g., direct patient care, testing, equipment, supplies, etc.).</li> </ul>	Exempts from liability in a civil action: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A <i>health care provider, first responder, or volunteer</i> who renders care to a potential, suspected, or diagnosed individual with COVID-19 for damages resulting from such care or treatment of COVID-19 (or from any act or failure to act in providing or arranging medical treatment for COVID-19) during the public health emergency.</li> <li>• A <i>donor of time, professional services equipment, or supplies</i> for the benefit of persons/entities providing care or treatment for COVID-19 (or care for the family members of such individuals) for damages resulting from such donating during the public health emergency.</li> <li>• A <i>contractor or subcontractor</i> on a District government contract that has contracted to provide health care services or human care services related to the District’s COVID-19 response.</li> </ul>	Does <u>not</u> extend the limitation on liability to acts or omissions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• That constitute a crime, actual fraud, actual malice, recklessness, breach of contract, gross negligence or willful misconduct.</li> <li>• Unrelated to direct patient care (except in the case of contractors and subcontractors).</li> </ul>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Utilize equipment or supplies out of the product’s normal use for medical practice and the provision of healthcare services to combat the COVID-19 virus.</li> </ul>		
Florida	<a href="#">SB 72</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Mar. 29, 2021)	<p><b>Person</b> includes any natural person, business entity, educational institution, government entity, or religious institution.</p> <p><b>Health care providers</b> includes clinical labs, federal health centers, health care practitioners, etc. involved in claims regarding:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The diagnosis or treatment of a person for COVID-19;</li> <li>The provision of a novel or experimental COVID-19 treatment;</li> <li>The transmission of COVID-19; and</li> <li>The delay or cancellation of a surgery or medical procedure.</li> </ul>	<p>Provides that any person or health care provider that made a <b>good faith effort</b> to substantially comply with government-issued health standards or guidance at the time of a COVID-19-related cause of action is immune from civil liability.</p> <p>Provides that a plaintiff must commence a civil action for a COVID-19-related claim within 1 year after the cause of action accrues or within 1 year after the effective date of this act if the cause of action accrued before the effective date of this act.</p>	<p>Provides that the safe harbor protections will <u>not</u> apply if the client is found grossly negligent, as proven by clear and convincing evidence, for any act or omission related to a COVID-19-related claim.</p> <p>Does <u>not</u> apply retroactively to civil actions commenced before the effective date of this act.</p>
Georgia	<a href="#">SB 359</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Aug. 5, 2020)	<p><b>Entities</b> including associations, institutions, corporations, companies, etc.</p>	<p>Establishes a rebuttable presumption of assumption of risk by a claimant in an action involving a COVID-19 liability claim against an <b>individual or entity</b> when:</p>	<p>Provides that the protections extended to a <b>health care facility, health care provider,</b></p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
			<p><b>Health care facility</b> (e.g., hospitals, destination cancer hospitals, other special care units, skilled nursing facilities, surgical centers, etc.).</p> <p><b>Health care provider</b>, including any physician or other person licensed to furnish health care services (e.g., dentists, podiatrists, optometrists, pharmacists, psychologists, clinical social workers, advanced practice registered nurses, etc.).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Any receipt or proof of purchase for entry issued to a claimant by the individual or entity for entry/attendance includes the following statement in at least 10-point Arial font: “Any person entering the premises waives all civil liability against this premises owner and operator for any injuries caused by the inherent risk associated with contracting COVID-19 at public gatherings, except for gross negligence, willful and wanton misconduct, reckless infliction of harm, or intentional infliction of harm, by the individual or entity of the premises.”</li> <li>An individual or entity has posted at a point of entry a sign in at least 1-inch Arial font the following written warning: “Warning: Under Georgia law, there is no liability for an injury or death of an individual entering these premises if such injury or death results from the inherent risks of contracting COVID-19. You are assuming this risk by entering these premises.”</li> </ul> <p>Establishes a rebuttable presumption of assumption of risk by a claimant when a <b>health care facility or health care provider</b> has posted at a point of entry to the premises a sign in at least 1-inch Arial font a written warning stating: “Warning: Under Georgia law, there is no liability for an injury or death of an individual entering these premises if such injury or death results from the inherent risks of contracting COVID-19. You are assuming this risk by entering these premises.”</p>	<p><b>entity, or individual</b> will <u>not</u> apply if the claimant proves that the actions of the facility, provider, entity, or individual showed: gross negligence, willful and wanton misconduct, reckless infliction of harm, or intentional infliction of harm.</p>
Indiana	<a href="#">SB 1</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Feb. 18,	<b>Person</b> (i.e., an individual, government entity, corporation,	Provides that a person is immune from civil tort liability for damages arising from COVID-19.	Does <u>not</u> grant immunity from civil tort liability to

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
		2021)	company, firm, or association).	<p>Provides that a person may <u>not</u> bring a <i>class action</i> lawsuit based on tort damages arising from COVID-19.</p> <p>Provides that a manufacturer or supplier is immune from civil tort liability for harm that results from the design, manufacture, labeling, sale, distribution, or donation of a COVID-19 protective product.</p>	a person whose actions or omissions constitute gross negligence or willful or wanton misconduct (including fraud and intentionally tortious acts) as proven by clear and convincing evidence.
Iowa	<a href="#">SF 2338</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (June 18, 2020)	<i>Health care providers</i> (i.e., health care professionals, health care facilities, home health care facilities, and any other person or facility otherwise authorized to administer health care services or products).	<p>Provides that <i>any person who possesses or is in control of a premises</i> who, directly or indirectly, invites or permits an individual onto a premises will <u>not</u> be liable for civil damages for any injuries sustained from the individual’s exposure to COVID-19.</p> <p>Clarifies that <i>a person</i> will not be held liable for civil damages for any injuries sustained from exposure or potential exposure to COVID-19 if the act or omission alleged to violate a duty of care was in substantial compliance with federal or state law, regulations, orders, or public health guidance related to COVID-19 that was applicable at the time of the alleged exposure.</p> <p>Provides that a <i>health care provider</i> will not be liable for civil damages for causing or contributing to the death or injury of an individual as a result of the provider’s acts or omissions while providing or arranging care in support of the state’s response to COVID-19.</p> <p>Provides that a <i>person that designs, manufactures, labels, sells, distributes, or donates household disinfecting or cleaning</i></p>	<p>Clarifies that the liability protections applicable to those in control of a premises will <u>not</u> apply if the person:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Recklessly disregards a substantial and unnecessary risk that the individual would be exposed to COVID-19.</li> <li>• Exposes the individual to COVID-19 through an act that constitutes actual malice.</li> <li>• Intentionally exposes the individual to COVID-19.</li> </ul> <p>Does <u>not</u> extend liability protections for health care providers that constitute reckless or</p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				<i>supplies, PPE, or a qualified product</i> in response to COVID-19 will not be liable in a civil action alleging personal injury, death, or property damage caused by the product <u>or</u> failure to provide proper instructions or sufficient warnings.	willful misconduct.  Clarifies that the protections for designers and manufacturers of cleaning supplies and PPE will <u>not</u> apply to the person that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Had actual knowledge of a defect in the product and recklessly disregarded a substantial and unnecessary risk that the product would cause serious personal injury, death, or serious property damage.</li> <li>• Made such products with actual malice.</li> </ul>
<b>Kansas</b>	HB 2016/ <a href="#">SB 283</a> / <a href="#">HB 2126</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (June 9, 2020/ Mar. 31, 2021/ Apr. 9, 2021)	<i>Health care providers</i> who are licensed, registered, certified, or otherwise authorized to provide health care services in the state.  <i>Covered facility</i> (i.e., an adult care home, community service provider, community mental health center, etc.).	Provides that a <i>health care provider</i> is immune from civil liability for damages, administrative fines, or penalties for acts, omissions, health care decisions, or the rendering of/the failure to render health care services related to the COVID-19 public health emergency.  Provides that a <i>person (or agent thereof) conducting business in Kansas</i> will be immune from civil liability for a COVID-19 claim if the person was acting pursuant to/in substantial compliance with the public health directives applicable to the activity giving rise to the cause of action when the cause of action accrued.	Does <u>not</u> provide immunity: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• When it is established that the act, omission, or health care decision constituted gross negligence or willful, wanton, or reckless conduct.</li> <li>• To health care services not related to COVID-19 that</li> </ul>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				<p>Provides that a <i>person who designs, manufactures, labels, sells, distributes, provides, or donates a qualified product</i> in response to the COVID-19 public health emergency will be immune from liability in a civil action alleging a product liability claim arising out of such qualified product if:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The product was manufactured, labeled, sold, etc. at the specific request of a written order or other directive finding a public need for such a product.</li> <li>• The damages are not occasioned by willful, wanton, or reckless disregard of a known, substantial, and unnecessary risk that the product would cause serious injury to others.</li> </ul>	<p>have not been altered, delayed, or withheld as a direct response to the COVID-19 public health emergency.</p>
Kentucky	<a href="#">SB 5</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Apr. 11, 2021)	<p><i>Owners</i> (i.e., possessors, tents, lessee, occupants, or person in control of any premises, and his or her employees and agents)</p> <p><i>Essential service providers</i> (e.g., organizations that provide charitable and social services; individuals and businesses needed for transportation; financial institutions; mail, post, shipping, and pick-up services; food establishments and suppliers; home-based services; individuals and businesses that supply medical and pharmaceutical products; health care providers; Medicaid waiver providers; elementary and secondary schools; child care</p>	<p>Provides that <i>owners</i> who follow any executive action to prevent the spread of COVID-19 during the declared emergency will be immune from liability for COVID-19 claims</p> <p>Provides that any <i>essential service providers</i> will be immune from liability for COVID-19 claims during the declared emergency.</p>	<p>Does <u>not</u> grant immunity from civil tort liability to a person whose actions or omissions constitute gross negligence or wanton, willful, malicious, or intentional misconduct.</p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
			service providers and facilities; funeral homes; local government agencies; and manufacturers located in Kentucky that produce or distribute medical and hygienic items (e.g., face masks, hand sanitizers, PPE))		
	<a href="#">SB 150</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Mar. 30, 2020)	<p><b>Health care providers</b> who:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide or dispense medicines for off-label use to attempt to combat COVID-19, in accordance with the federal Right to Try Act.</li> <li>• Provide health care services, upon the request of health care facilities or public health entities, that are outside the provider’s professional scope of practice.</li> <li>• Utilize equipment or supplies outside of the product’s normal use for medical practice and the provision of health care services.</li> </ul>	<p>Provides that <b>certain health care providers</b> who in good faith render care or treatment of a COVID-19 patient during the state of emergency will have a defense to civil liability for ordinary negligence for any personal injury resulting from said care or treatment (or for any act/failure to act in providing or arranging further medical treatment), if the health care provider acts as an ordinary, reasonable, and prudent health care provider would have acted under the same/similar circumstances.</p> <p>Separately, provides that <b>any business that manufactures PPE or personal hygiene supplies relative to COVID-19</b> (e.g., masks, gowns, sanitizer) during and in response to the state of emergency <b>and does not make or provide such products in the normal course of its business</b> will have a defense to ordinary negligence and product liability so long as the business has acted in good faith and in an ordinary, reasonable and prudent manner under the same/similar circumstances.</p>	
Louisiana	<a href="#">HB 826</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (June 13, 2020)		Provides that no <b>natural or juridical person, state or local government, or political subdivision thereof</b> will be liable for any civil	Does <u>not</u> confer immunity on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The person,</li> </ul>



State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				<p>damages for injury or death resulting from or related to actual or alleged exposure to COVID-19 in the course of or through the performance of the person’s, government’s, or political subdivision’s business operations.</p> <p>Specifically provides that no <i>natural or juridical person, state or local government, or political subdivision thereof, nor specifically a business event strategist; association meeting planner; corporate meeting planner; independent trade show organizer or owner; or any other entity hosting, promoting, producing, or otherwise organizing an event of any kind</i> will be liable for any civil damages for injury or death resulting from or related to actual or alleged exposure to COVID-19 in the course of/through the performance of hosting, promoting, producing, or otherwise organizing, planning, or owning a tradeshow, convention, meeting, association produced event, corporate event, sporting event, or exhibition of any kind.</p> <p>Separately, provides that neither of the following will be liable for civil damages for injury or death caused by PPE:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Natural or juridical person that designs, manufactures, labels, or distributes PPE</i> in response to the COVID-19 public health emergency.</li> <li>• <i>Natural or juridical person who uses, employs, dispenses, or administers PPE</i></li> </ul>	<p>government, or political subdivision; or</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The person who uses, employs, dispenses, or administers PPE, if they failed to substantially comply with the applicable COVID-19 procedures established by federal, state, or local agency which governs the business operations or PPE <u>and</u> the injury or death was caused by the person’s, government’s, or political subdivision’s gross negligence or wanton reckless misconduct.</li> </ul> <p>Does <u>not</u> confer immunity if the damages were caused by the gross negligence or willful or wanton misconduct of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The business event strategist, association meeting planner, etc.</li> <li>• The designer, manufacturer, distributor, etc. of PPE.</li> </ul>
	<a href="#">SB 435</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (June 12,		Provides that no <i>natural or juridical person,</i>	Does <u>not</u> confer

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
		2020)		<i>state or local government, or political subdivision thereof</i> will be liable for any civil damages for injury or death resulting from or related to actual or alleged exposure to COVID-19 in the course of or through the performance of the person’s, government’s, or political subdivision’s business operations.	immunity on the person, government, or political subdivision if they failed to substantially comply with the applicable COVID-19 procedures established by federal, state, or local agency which governs the business operations <u>and</u> the injury or death was caused by their gross negligence or wanton reckless misconduct.
	<a href="#">SB 508</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (June 12, 2020)	<i>Restaurants</i> (i.e., eating establishments that vie or offer for retail sale prepared food to the public within its premises).	Provides that no <i>owner, operator, employee, contractor or agent of a restaurant</i> which is in substantial compliance with: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The state’s reopening order and any subsequent related proclamations; and</li> <li>• Applicable COVID-19 procedures established by federal, state, or local agencies</li> </ul> will be civilly liable for injury or death due to COVID-19 infection transmitted through the preparation and serving of food and beverage products by the restaurant during the COVID-19 public health emergency.	Does <u>not</u> confer immunity if the injury or death was caused by gross negligence or willful and wonton misconduct.
	<a href="#">SB 491</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (June 12, 2020)		Provides that, during a declared state of emergency, any <i>natural or juridical person</i> who renders disaster relief, recovery services, or products outside of the typical course and scope of their operations in coordination with federal, state, or local government will not be liable to recipient for any injury or death or a person or	Does <u>not</u> confer immunity in the event of gross negligence or willful misconduct.

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				may damage to property resulting therefrom.	
Massachusetts	<a href="#">SB 2640</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Apr. 17, 2020)	<p><b>Health care facilities</b> (e.g., hospitals, state hospitals, mental health centers, psychiatric hospitals, skilled nursing facilities, etc.).</p> <p><b>Health care professionals</b>, whether acting as an agent, volunteer, contractor, employee, or otherwise, who are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Authorized to provide health care services pursuant to licensure or certification.</li> <li>• A student or trainee in their approved medical professional services academic training program.</li> <li>• A nursing attendant or certified nursing aid.</li> <li>• A nurse or home health aide.</li> </ul> <p><b>Volunteer organization</b> that makes its facility available to support the state’s response and activities during the COVID-19 emergency.</p>	<p>Provides that <b>health care professionals and health care facilities</b> will be immune from suit and civil liability for any damages alleged to have been sustained by an act or omission by the health care professional or health care facility in the course of providing health care services during the COVID-19 emergency, provided that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The health care facility or health care professional is arranging for or providing health care services pursuant to a COVID-19 emergency rule and in accordance with otherwise applicable law.</li> <li>• Arranging for or providing care or treatment of the individual was impacted by the health care facility’s or health care professional’s decisions or activities in response to treatment conditions resulting from the COVID-19 outbreak or COVID-19 emergency rules.</li> <li>• The health care facility or health care professional is arranging for or providing health care services in good faith.</li> </ul> <p>Separately provides that a <b>volunteer organization</b> will be immune from suit and civil liability for any damages occurring in or at the volunteer organization’s facility where the damage arises from uses the facility for the state’s response and activities related to the COVID-19 emergency.</p>	<p>Clarifies that the immunity will not apply:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• If the damage was caused by an act or omission constituting gross negligence, recklessness, or conduct with an intent to harm or to discriminate based on race, ethnicity, national origin, religion, disability, sexual orientation, or gender identity by a health care facility or health care professional providing health care services.</li> <li>• To consumer protection actions brought by the attorney general.</li> <li>• To false claims actions brought by or on behalf of the state.</li> </ul> <p>Clarifies that the immunity will not apply to a volunteer organization if it is established that the damages were caused by</p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
					the volunteer organization’s gross negligence, recklessness, or conduct with an intent to harm.
Michigan	<a href="#">HB 6159</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Oct. 22, 2020)	<b>Health care provider</b> (i.e., individuals licensed to engage in the practice of a health profession, emergency services personnel, etc.).  <b>Health care facility</b> , including health facilities, state-owned surgical centers, state-operated outpatient facilities, state-operated veterans facilities, etc.	Provides that a <b>health care provider</b> or <b>health care facility</b> that provides health care services will not be liable for an injury sustained by reason of those services, regardless of how those injuries are sustained.	Clarifies that the immunity will <u>not</u> apply if the injury is caused by willful misconduct, gross negligence, intentional and willful criminal conduct, or intentional infliction of harm by the health care provider or health care facility.
	<a href="#">HB 6031</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Oct. 22, 2020)		Provides that an <b>employer</b> is not liable for an employee’s exposure to COVID-19 if the employer was operating in compliance with all federal, state, and local statutes, rules, and regulations related to COVID-19.  Clarifies that an isolated, de minimis deviation from strict compliance with such rules unrelated to the employee’s exposure to COVID-19 does <u>not</u> deny an employer the immunity.	
	<a href="#">HB 6030</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Oct. 22, 2020)	<b>Person</b> (i.e., individuals, partnerships, corporations, other legal entities, etc.).	Provides that a <b>person</b> who acts in compliance with all federal, state, and local statutes, rules, and regulations related to COVID-19 is immune from liability for a COVID-19 claim.	

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				Clarifies that an isolated, de minimis deviation from strict compliance with such rules unrelated to the employee’s exposure to COVID-19 does <u>not</u> deny a person the immunity.	
Mississippi	<a href="#">SB 3049</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (July 8, 2020)	<p><b>Health care facility</b> (i.e., any facility in which health care services are provided).</p> <p><b>Health care professional</b> who is licensed, registered, permitted, or certified to provide health care services (and emergency medical technicians, volunteer or military personnel who are approved to provide health care services, etc.).</p> <p><b>Person</b> (i.e., an individual, the state, association, educational entity, for-profit or nonprofit entity, religious organization, or charitable organization).</p>	<p>Provides that any <b>health care professional</b> or <b>health care facility</b> will be immune from suit for injury or death sustained because of their acts or omissions while providing health care services related to the COVID-19 state of emergency.</p> <p>Provides that the immunity includes (but is not limited to):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Injury or death resulting from screening, assessing, diagnosing, or treating persons in relation to the COVID-19 state of emergency or the medical conditions causing the state of emergency.</li> <li>• Acts or omissions while providing health care services to persons unrelated to the COVID-19 state of emergency when those acts or omissions were intended to support the state’s response to the COVID-19 state of emergency (e.g., delaying/cancelling nonurgent elective surgeries, diagnosing or treating patients outside the normal scope of the health care professional’s license, using equipment or supplies outside of the product’s normal use, etc.).</li> </ul> <p>Provides that a <b>person who designs, manufactures, labels, sells, distributes, or donates a qualified product</b> in response to COVID-19 will be immune from civil suit for any injuries resulting from or related to actual or</p>	Provides that the immunities offered do <u>not</u> apply where the plaintiff shows—by clear and convincing evidence—that a defendant acted with actual malice.

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				<p>alleged exposure or potential exposure to COVID-19 caused by a qualified product.</p> <p>Extends these protections to a <i>person who designs, manufactures, labels, sells, distributes, or donates disinfecting or cleaning supplies or personal protective equipment in response to COVID-19</i> outside the ordinary course of their business.</p>	
Montana	<a href="#">SB 65</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Feb. 10, 2021)	<p><i>Person</i>, including individuals, corporations, nonprofit corporations, businesses, associations, places of worship, and any other legal or commercial entity.</p> <p><i>Health care provider</i>, including health care professional, health care facility, home health care facility, assisted living facility, and any other person or facility otherwise authorized or permitted to administer health care services or treatment.</p>	<p>Provides that a <i>person</i> who possesses or is in control of a premises (e.g., tenant, lessee, or occupant) is not liable for civil damages for injuries or death as a result of exposure to COVID-19.</p> <p>Provides that a <i>health care provider</i> is not liable for civil damages for the death or injury of an individual as a result of the health care provider's acts or omissions while providing or arranging health care in support of the response to COVID-19.</p> <p>Extends these protections to a <i>person who designs, manufactures, labels, sells, distributes, or donates disinfecting or cleaning supplies or personal protective equipment in response to COVID-19</i>.</p> <p>Provides an <i>affirmative defense</i> for taking reasonable measures consistent with regulations, orders, and public health guidance.</p> <p>Clarifies that a government order, regulation, or public health guidance regarding COVID-19 does <u>not</u> create a new cause of action against any person.</p>	<p>Clarifies that the immunity will <u>not</u> apply if the civil action involves an act or omission that constitutes gross negligence, willful and wanton misconduct, or intentional tort.</p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				Clarifies that a person is <u>not</u> required to ensure that certain safety recommendations or requirements are followed (e.g., face masks, temperature checks, vaccines) provided by federal or state statute, order, or public health guidance.	
Nevada	<a href="#">SB 4</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Aug. 11, 2020)	<i>Entities</i> , including businesses, governmental entities, or nonprofit organizations and the officers and employees thereof.	Provides that, in any civil action where a plaintiff alleges a personal injury/death as a result of exposure to COVID-19 while on a premises owned or operated by an entity, the <i>entity</i> will generally be immune from liability.	Provides that the immunity will not extend if the plaintiff pleads sufficient facts and proves that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The entity violated (or was not in substantial compliance with) controlling health standards with gross negligence.</li> <li>• The gross negligence was the proximate cause of the plaintiff’s personal injury/death.</li> </ul>
New Jersey	<a href="#">SB 2333</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Apr. 14, 2020)	<i>Health care professionals</i> , including a physician, physician assistant, advanced practice nurse, registered nurse, licensed practical nurse, other health care professional whose professional practice is regulated by the state or who is otherwise authorized to provide health care services in the state, an emergency medical technician, etc.	Provides that a <i>health care professional</i> will not be liable for civil damages for injury or death alleged to have been sustained because of an act or omission by the health care professional in the course of providing medical services to support the state’s response to COVID-19.  Provides that a <i>health care facility</i> or a <i>health care system</i> will not be liable for civil damages for injury or death alleged to have been sustained as a result of an act or omission by one or more	Clarifies that the immunity granted will <u>not</u> apply to acts or omissions constituting a crime, actual fraud, actual malice, gross negligence, recklessness, or willful misconduct.

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
			<p><i>Health care facilities</i> used, operated, or designed to provide health services; medical or dental treatment or nursing; or rehabilitative or preventive care to any person (e.g., an ambulatory surgical facility, home health agency, hospice, hospital, infirmary, intermediate care facility, dialysis center, long-term care facility, medical assistance facility, mental health center, etc.) <u>and</u> related property when used for or in connection with any of the health services (e.g., a laboratory, research facility, pharmacy, laundry facility, health personnel training and lodging facility, etc.).</p>	<p>of its agents, officers, employees, etc., if—and to the extent such agent, officer, employee, etc.—is immune from liability based on their status as a health care professional.</p> <p>Clarifies that immunity will extend to any act or omission undertaken in good faith by a health care professional or health care facility/health care system to support efforts to treat COVID-19 patients and to prevent the spread of COVID-19.</p> <p>Separately, provides that a health care facility or a health care system will not be criminally or civilly liable for damages for injury or death alleged to have been sustained as a result of an act or omission by the facility; system; or one or more of the facility’s/system’s agents, officers, employees, etc. during the public health emergency in connection with the allocation of mechanical ventilators or other scarce medical resources, provided the health care facility or system adopts and adheres to a scarce critical resource allocation policy that—at a minimum—incorporates the “core principals” identified by the Commissioner.</p> <p>Extends liability protections to the health care facility’s or system’s agents, officers, employees, etc. for such an injury.</p>	
New York	<a href="#">A 3397 /SB 8835</a>	<b>REPEALED</b> (Apr. 6, 2021)		<p>Limits the reach of the state’s safe harbor provisions such that it will not extend to all individuals that are present at a health care facility or with a health care professional.</p> <p>Rather, applies the safe harbor strictly to the diagnosis or treatment of COVID-19 <u>or</u> the</p>	



State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				<p>assessment or care of an individual who has a confirmed or suspected case of COVID-19.</p> <p>Similarly, provides that the safe harbor will <u>not</u> apply to the extent the health care facility or health care professional is “arranging for” health care services (i.e., the protections will only apply to the extent the facility or professional are providing services).</p>	
	<a href="#">A 3397/ SB 7506</a>	<b>REPEALED</b> (Apr. 6, 2021)	<p><b>Health care facility</b> (e.g., a hospital, nursing home, or other facility licensed/authorized to provide health care services for any individual).</p> <p><b>Health care professional</b> (e.g., a nursing attendant, a person licensed to provide emergency medical services, a home care services worker, etc.).</p> <p><b>Volunteer organization</b> that has made its facility available to support the state’s response and activities under the COVID-19 emergency declaration and in accordance with any applicable COVID-19 emergency rule.</p>	<p>Provides that any <b>health care facility or health care professional</b> will have immunity from any civil or criminal liability for any harm or damages alleged to have been sustained as a result of an act or omission in the course of arranging for or providing health care services, if:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The health care facility or health care professional is arranging for or providing health care services pursuant to a COVID-19 emergency rule or otherwise in accordance with applicable law.</li> <li>• The act or omission occurs in the course of arranging for or providing health care services and the treatment of the individual is impacted by their decisions or activities in response to/as a result of the COVID-19 outbreak and in support of the state’s directives.</li> <li>• The health care facility or health care professional is arranging for or providing health care services in good faith.</li> </ul> <p>Separately, provides that a <b>volunteer organization</b> will have immunity from any civil or criminal liability for any harm or damages</p>	<p>Clarifies that the immunity does <u>not</u> apply if the harm or damages were caused by an act or omission constituting willful or intentional criminal misconduct, gross negligence, reckless misconduct, or intentional infliction of harm by the health care facility or health care professional providing the health care services <u>or</u> by the volunteer organization</p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				irrespective of the cause of such harm or damage occurring in or at its facility arising from the state’s response and activities under the COVID-19 emergency declaration.	
North Carolina	<a href="#">SB 208</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (July 1, 2020)	<b><i>Institutions of higher education</i></b> (i.e., a constituent institution under the jurisdiction of the University of North Carolina, a community college, an eligible private postsecondary institution).	Grants immunity from claims by an individual if: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The claim arises out of/is in connection with tuition or fees paid to the <b><i>institution of higher education</i></b> (IHE) for the spring academic semester of 2020;</li> <li>• The claim alleges losses or damages arising from an act or omission by the IHE during/in response to COVID-19;</li> <li>• The alleged act or omission by the IHE was reasonably related to protecting the public health, safety, or welfare in response to COVID-19; <u>and</u></li> <li>• The IHE offered remote learning options for enrolled students during the spring academic semester of 2020 that allowed students to complete the semester’s coursework.</li> </ul>	Does <u>not</u> apply to losses or damages that resulted from: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A breach of an express contractual provision allocating liability in the event of a pandemic event.</li> <li>• An act or omission of the IHE that was in bad faith or malicious.</li> </ul>
	<a href="#">SB 704</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (May 4, 2020)	<b><i>Health care facilities</i></b> and licensed clinical laboratories.  <b><i>Health care providers</i></b> (e.g., individuals licensed to provide health care services in the ordinary course of business, health care facilities where health care services are provided to patients, any emergency medical services personnel, an office or	Provides that any <b><i>health care facility, health care provider, or entity that has legal responsibility for the acts or omissions of a health care provider</i></b> will have immunity from any civil liability for any harm or damages alleged to have been sustained as a result of an act or omission in the course of arranging for or providing health care services <u>only</u> if all of the following apply: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The health care facility, health care provider, or entity is arranging for or providing health</li> </ul>	Does <u>not</u> apply civil liability if the harm or damages were caused by an act or omission constituting gross negligence, reckless misconduct, or intentional infliction of harm by the health care facility, health care provider providing health

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
			<p>director of a health care facility, etc.).</p> <p><b><i>A volunteer organization</i></b>, including any medical organization, company, or institution that has made its facilities available to support the state’s response and activities under the COVID-19 emergency declaration.</p> <p><b><i>Essential businesses</i></b>, non-profit organizations, educational institutions, and governmental entities identified in the COVID-19 essential businesses executive order (and any business that the Department of Revenue determines is essential).</p> <p><b><i>Emergency response entities</i></b> that manufacture, produce, or distribute PPE, testing equipment, or ventilators <u>or</u> process COVID-19 testing results.</p>	<p>care services during the COVID-19 emergency declaration.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The arrangement or provision of health care services is impacted, directly or indirectly, by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– A health care facility, health care provider, or entity’s decision or activities in response to or as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic; or</li> <li>– The decisions or activities, in response to or as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, of a health care facility or entity where a health care provider provides health care services.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• The health care facility, health care provider, or entity is arranging for or providing health care services in good faith.</li> </ul> <p>Provides that a <b><i>volunteer organization</i></b> will have immunity from any civil liability or any harm or damages occurring in or at its facility arising from the state’s response and activities under the COVID-19 emergency declaration.</p> <p>Provides that the following entities are immune from civil liability:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An <b><i>essential business</i></b> that provides goods or services with respect to claims from any customer or employee for any injuries or death alleged to have been caused as a result of the customer or employee contracting COVID-19 while doing business with or while employed by the essential business.</li> <li>• An <b><i>emergency response entity</i></b> with respect to claims from any customer, user, or</li> </ul>	<p>care services, or volunteer organization.</p> <p>Does <u>not</u> extend immunity from civil liability if the injuries or death were caused by an act or omission of the essential business or emergency response entity constituting gross negligence, reckless misconduct, or intentional infliction of harm.</p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				consumer for any injuries or death alleged to have been caused as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic or while doing business with the emergency response entity.	
Ohio	<a href="#">HB 606</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Sept. 14, 2020)	<p><b>Health care provider</b> (i.e., a health care professional, health care worker, direct support professional, behavioral health provider, or emergency medical technician, etc.).</p> <p><b>Health care services</b> rendered by a health care provider for the diagnosis, prevention, treatment, cure, or relief of a health condition, illness, injury, etc.</p> <p><b>Person</b> (i.e., individual, corporation, business trust, estate, trust, partnership, and association).</p>	<p>Provides that a <b>health care provider that provides health care services, emergency medical services, first aid treatment, or other emergency professional care</b> as a result of/in response to a disaster or emergency will be liable in any tort action for injury, death, or loss that allegedly arises from:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An act or omission of the health care provider in their provision, withholding, or withdrawal of those services.</li> <li>• Any decision related to the provision, withholding, or withdrawal of those services.</li> <li>• Compliance with an executive order or director’s order issued during/in response to a disaster or emergency.</li> </ul> <p>Similarly, provides that such health care providers will not be liable in tort for injury, death, or loss to person or property that allegedly arises because the provider was unable to treat, diagnose, or test the person for any illness, disease, or condition due to an executive order or an order of a board of health of a city/general health district issued in relation to a pandemic or other public health emergency.</p> <p>Provides that no civil action for damages for injury, death, or loss to person or property may</p>	<p>Does <u>not</u> apply in a tort action if the provider’s action, omission, decision, or compliance constitutes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A reckless disregard for the consequences so as to affect the life or health of the patient.</li> <li>• Intentional misconduct.</li> <li>• Willful or wanton misconduct on the part of the provider.</li> </ul> <p>Likewise, does <u>not</u> apply in a professional disciplinary action if the provider’s action, omission, decision, or compliance constitutes gross negligence.</p> <p>Provides that the broad liability protections applicable to all persons will <u>not</u> apply if the exposure to/transmission</p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				be brought against any <i>person</i> if the cause of action on which the civil action is based is caused by the exposure to (or transmission or contraction of) MERS, SARS, or COVID-19.	or contraction of any of those viruses was by reckless conduct, intentional misconduct, or willful or wanton misconduct on the part of the person.
Oklahoma	<a href="#">SB 1947</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (May 21, 2020)	<p><i>Health care facilities</i> that are used, operated, or designed to provide health services; medical treatment; or nursing, rehabilitative, or preventive care to any person (e.g., ambulatory surgical facilities, hospitals, infirmaries, intermediate care facilities, kidney dialysis centers, etc.) <u>and</u> related property when used for or in connection with any of the health services (e.g., laboratories; research facilities; pharmacies; laundry facilities; health personnel training and lodging facilities, etc.).</p> <p><i>Health care providers</i> who provide health care services (e.g., physicians, pharmacists, dentists, physician assistants, nurse practitioners, registered and other nurses, paramedics, etc.).</p>	<p>Provides that any <i>person that designs, manufactures, labels, sells, distributes, or donates disinfecting and cleaning supplies</i> (e.g., hand sanitizer, disinfectants, sprays, wipes) <b>or PPE</b> (e.g., coveralls, face shields, gloves, gowns, masks, respirators, etc.) during and in response to the COVID-19 public health emergency that does <u>not</u> make such products in the ordinary course of business will <u>not</u> be liable in a civil action alleging personal injury, death, or property damage caused by or resulting from the product’s manufacturing, design, or failure to provide proper instructions or sufficient warnings.</p> <p>Extends immunity to <i>a government entity, health care facility, health care provider, first responder, or any business (or any employer/agent of such business) that utilizes such a product</i> such that they will not be liable in a civil action alleging personal injury, death, or property damage caused by or resulting from the selection, distribution, or use of such product.</p>	<p>Limits immunity such that it will not apply to any person, employee, or agent that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Had actual knowledge that the product was defective when put to the use for which the product was manufactured, sold, distributed, or donated <u>and</u> acted with deliberate indifference to or conscious disregard of a substantial and unnecessary risk that the product would cause serious injury to others.</li> <li>• Acted with a deliberate intention to cause harm.</li> </ul>
	<a href="#">SB 1946</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (May 21, 2020)	<i>Person</i> (e.g., an individual, firm, partnership, corporation, or association).	Provides that a <i>person or agent thereof who conducts business in Oklahoma</i> will not be liable in a civil action claiming an injury from	

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				<p>exposure or potential exposure to COVID-19, if the act or omission was in compliance or consistent with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Federal or state regulations.</li> <li>• A presidential or gubernatorial executive order.</li> <li>• Guidance applicable at the time of the alleged exposure.</li> </ul>	
	<a href="#">SB 300</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (May 12, 2020)	<p><b>Health care facilities</b> that are used, operated, or designed to provide health services; medical treatment; or nursing, rehabilitative, or preventive care to any person (e.g., ambulatory surgical facilities, hospitals, infirmaries, intermediate care facilities, kidney dialysis centers, etc.) <u>and</u> related property when used for or in connection with any of the health services (e.g., laboratories; research facilities; pharmacies; laundry facilities; health personnel training and lodging facilities, etc.).</p> <p><b>Health care providers</b> who provide health care services (e.g., physicians, pharmacists, dentists, physician assistants, nurse practitioners, registered and other nurses, paramedics, etc.).</p>	<p>Provides that a <b>health care facility or health care provider</b> will be immune from civil liability for any loss or harm to a person with a suspected or confirmed diagnosis of COVID-19 caused by an act or omission by the facility or provider that occurs during the COVID-19 public health emergency, if the act or omission occurred in the course of arranging for/providing COVID-19 health care services for the treatment of the person who was impacted by the decisions, activities or staffing of, or the availability/capacity of space or equipment by the health care facility or provider in response to/as a result of the COVID-19 public health emergency.</p>	<p>Only applies to the extent the act or omission was <u>not</u> the result of gross negligence or willful or wanton misconduct of the health care facility or health care provider rendering the health care services.</p> <p>Does <u>not</u> grant immunity from civil liability for an act or omission in the provision of health care services to a person who <u>did not</u> have a suspected or confirmed diagnosis of COVID-19 at the time of the services.</p>
<b>South Dakota</b>	<a href="#">HB 1046</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Feb. 18,	<b>Person</b> includes individuals, corporate or common law	Provides that a <b>person</b> who possesses or is in control of a premises (e.g., tenant, lessee,	Does <u>not</u> grant immunity from civil liability if a

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
		2021)	<p>entities, and business entities.</p> <p><b>Health care providers</b>, including health care professional, health care facility, home health care facility, and any other person or facility otherwise authorized to administer health care services or treatment, including first responders.</p>	<p>or occupant of a premises) is not be liable for damages for any injuries sustained from an individual’s exposure to COVID-19.</p> <p>Provides that a <b>health care provider</b> is not liable for any damages for the death or injury of a person as a result of the health care provider’s acts or omissions in response to COVID-19.</p> <p>Extends these protections to a <b>person who designs, manufactures, labels, sells, distributes, or donates disinfecting or cleaning supplies or personal protective equipment in response to COVID-19.</b></p>	<p>person intentionally exposes an individual to COVID-19 with the intent to transmit COVID-19.</p>
Tennessee	<a href="#">SB 8002</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Aug. 17, 2020)	<p><b>Person</b> includes individuals, health care providers, corporations, partnerships, nonprofits, etc.</p>	<p>Provides that, in general, there is no claim against a <b>person</b> for loss, damage, injury, or death arising from COVID-19.</p> <p>Contains additional protections for governmental entities, institutions of higher education, etc.</p>	<p>Clarifies that such claims may be raised if the claimant proves by clear and convincing evidence that the person caused the loss, damage, injury, or death by an act or omission constituting gross negligence or willful misconduct.</p>
Utah	<a href="#">SB 3007</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (May 4, 2020)	<p><b>Person</b> includes individuals, associations, institutions, corporations, etc.</p>	<p>Renders a <b>person</b> immune from civil liability for damages or an injury resulting from exposure of an individual to COVID-19 on the premises owned or operated by the person (or during an activity managed by the person).</p>	<p>Provides that immunity does <u>not</u> apply to willful misconduct, reckless infliction of harm, or intentional infliction of harm.</p>
Virginia	<a href="#">HB 5059/SB 5032</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (Oct. 13, 2020)		<p>Provides that <b>certain care centers</b> (i.e., hospice centers, home care organizations, assisted living</p>	<p>Provides that immunity does <u>not</u> apply to gross</p>

State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				facilities, or adult day care centers) that deliver care to patients diagnosed with COVID-19 will <u>not</u> be liable for any injury or wrongful death of the patient when the emergency results in a lack of resources that render such facilities unable to provide the level/manner of care that otherwise would have been required.	negligence or willful misconduct.
West Virginia	<a href="#">SB 277</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (March 22, 2021)	<i>Person</i> includes individuals, associations, institutions, corporations, healthcare facilities, etc.	Provides that any <i>person</i> is immune from civil liability for damages for an injury resulting from exposure of an individual to COVID-19 on the premises owned or operated by the person, or during an activity supervised, sponsored, or managed by the person, so long as the person was acting in compliance or consistent with applicable federal or state regulations, orders, or other guidance.	Provides that immunity does <u>not</u> apply to willful or wanton misconduct; reckless infliction of harm; intentional of harm; or gross negligence.
Wisconsin	<a href="#">HB 1038</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (May 28, 2020)	<i>Health care professional</i> (i.e., an individual licensed, registered, or certified by the medical examining board).  <i>Health care provider</i> (e.g., a nurse, chiropractor, dentist, physician, dietician, social worker, etc. <u>and</u> an adult family home).	Provides that any <i>health care professional; health care provider; or employee, agent, or contractor thereof</i> is immune from civil liability for the death of or injury to any individual or any damages caused by actions or omissions, provided the following requirements are satisfied: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The action or omission is committed during the state of emergency or the 60 days following the date that the state of emergency ends.</li> <li>• The actions or omissions relate to health services provided or not provided in good faith or are substantially consistent with either (1) any direction, guidance, recommendation, or other statement by a federal, state, or local official to address or in response to the emergency/disaster; or (2)</li> </ul>	Extends immunity only to the extent that the actions or omissions do <u>not</u> involve reckless or wanton conduct or intentional misconduct.



State	Bill	Status	Application of Safe Harbor	Safe Harbor	Exceptions
				<p>any guidance published by the department of health services, the federal department of health and human services, or any divisions of such agencies relied upon in good faith.</p> <p>Separately, provides that any <i>person engaged in the manufacturing, distribution, or sale of emergency medical supplies</i>, who donates or sells, at a price that does <u>not</u> exceed the cost of production, emergency medical supplies to a charitable organization or governmental unit to respond to the COVID-19 health emergency is immune from civil liability for the death of or injury to any individual caused by the emergency medical supplies donated or sold by the person.</p> <p>Provides that any <i>charitable organization</i> that distributes free of charge emergency medical supplies received from a person engaged in the manufacturing, distribution, or sale of emergency medical supplies is immune from civil liability for the death of or injury to an individual caused by the emergency medical supplies distributed by the charitable organization.</p>	
Wyoming	<a href="#">SF 1002</a>	<b>ENACTED</b> (May 20, 2020)	<i>Health care providers</i> (including those who are retired, who have an inactive license, or who are licensed in another state without a valid Wyoming license and while performing as a volunteer during a declared public health emergency).	Provides that, during a public health emergency, a <i>health care provider or other person—including a business entity</i> —who in good faith follows the instructions of the state, city, town, or county health officer (or who acts in good faith in responding to the public health emergency) will be immune from any liability arising from complying with those instructions or acting in good faith.	Clarifies that the immunity does <u>not</u> apply to acts of omissions constituting gross negligence or willful or wanton misconduct.